

Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Excellent

Explanation to Applicant

The proposed project is well-reasoned, well-organized, and based on a sound rationale. The applicant is well qualified to carry out the proposed research as demonstrated through previous research experience. The applicants references indicate maturity and strong evidence for future success.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Excellent

Explanation to Applicant

The applicant has been involved in multiple education and outreach activities and plans to continue and extend this work as part of the proposed project. In addition, the applicant clearly articulates the importance of the proposed research to conservation efforts.

Summary Comments

The applicant shows solid academic preparation and great maturity through previous experiences and the development of a well-written proposal for research. The applicant clearly articulates the importance of the proposed research to society.

Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Excellent

Explanation to Applicant

The applicant has strong research experiences that give her both a broad and deep knowledge base. I am impressed with her demonstration of knowledge on these diverse undergraduate research experiences. She is in her second year of her PhD program, and has demonstrated considerable progress with her research project, and has presented at a few conferences and attended various workshops. The intellectual merit of the proposed research is high, and I think this is a solid and well designed study. The research proposal makes clear links to the mechanism and process of speciation, but this could be better tied to the methods that will be used and potential results.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Excellent

Explanation to Applicant

I am really impressed with Kathryn's broader impacts and outreach. She has created a website with advice for designing scientific posters. I visited the site and found it very good, and plan to pass on the link to students in my lab! She also demonstrates various activities with undergrads and other mentorship roles.

Summary Comments

Overall this is a very strong application. The applicant demonstrates very clear goals and focus, as well as initiative. She has extensive research experiences that allow her to place her research in a broad context.

Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

The applicant proposes to estimate inter and intraspecific phylogenies of tenrecs (Madagascar), delimit species boundaries, estimate times of divergence and use ENM to consider environmental correlates of distribution patterns. The research is timely and do-able, given that all samples have been collected, and will shed light on Malagasy biogeographic patterns. The application is well-written and clear. The applicant has a good academic record and records.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

The personal statement includes many examples of broader impacts in which the applicant has been involved and is involved. She does not include specifics in the proposal itself but the personal statement makes it fairly clear what some of these activities will be. Her desire to work in a natural history museum setting has the potential to lead to a lifetime of education and outreach.

Summary Comments